original

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS TENTH CIRCUIT

MEMORIAL PROCEEDINGS HONORING JUDGE ALFRED P. MURRAH

United States Court House
Oklahoma City, Oklahoma
March 15, 1978

Frank M. Sickles Official Court Reporter P. O. Box 1975 Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73101

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS 1 2 TENTH CIRCUIT 3 4 MEMORIAL PROCEEDINGS HONORING JUDGE ALFRED P. MURRAH 5 United States Court House 6 Oklahoma City, Oklahoma March 15, 1978 8 9 **BEFORE:** 10 HONORABLE OLIVER SETH, Presiding Chief Judge, U. S. Court of Appeals 11 Santa Fe, New Mexico 87501 12 HONORABLE WILLIAM J. HOLLOWAY, JR. U. S. Circuit Judge 13 Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73101 14 HONORABLE ROBERT H. McWILLIAMS U. S. Circuit Judge 15 Denver, Colorado 80294 16 HONORABLE JAMES E. BARRETT U. S. Circuit Judge 17 Cheyenne, Wyoming 82001 18 HONORABLE WILLIAM E. DOYLE U. S. Circuit Judge 19 Denver, Colorado 80294 20 HONORABLE MONROE G. McKAY U. S. Circuit Judge 21 Salt Lake City, Utah 84138 22 HONORABLE JAMES K. LOGAN U. S. Circuit Judge 23 Kansas City, Kansas 66101 24

	2	
1	<u>I N D E X</u>	
2		
3	Opening:	
4	Chief Judge Oliver Seth Page 3	
5		
6	Addresses:	
7	Donald S. Kennedy, Chairman of the Board	
8	Oklahoma Gas and Électric Company	
9	Daniel G. Gibbens, Professor	
10	College of Law, University of Oklahoma	
11	William J. Holloway, Jr.	
12	U. S. Circuit Judge	
13	·	
14	Closing Remarks:	
15	Chief Judge Oliver Seth 21	
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21	·	
22		i
23		
24		
25		
	·	

2

3

4

5

6

7 8

10 11

12

13

14

15 16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24

25

PROCEEDINGS

March 15, 1978

CHIEF JUDGE SETH: Good afternoon. We are convened today for the very special purpose of receiving a memorial honoring Judge Murrah. We are very pleased to have Judge Murrah's family It adds a great deal; very pleased to have you, and also to have all the District Judges from Oklahoma present. We thank you for coming also.

We are grateful for the presence of the other friends and associates of Judge Murrah.

The Court has asked Mr. Kennedy and Professor Gibbens to be here today and to participate and to offer a memorial in honor of Judge Murrah. I think we will call on Mr. Kennedy first. I think you all know him. He is a very successful businessman, a long time friend and associate of Judge Murrah and Mrs. Murrah.

MR. KENNEDY: Thank you. I don't know whether I am supposed to face the Court or face the audience. What do you suggest?

Mr. Kennedy.

CHIEF JUDGE SETH: Well, I think that's good, right where you are.

MR. KENNEDY: You answered my question.

CHIEF JUDGE SETH: You are equal to most any situation.

MR. KENNEDY: Well, I don't know about that. You know,

I am very happy to be here and to discuss anyone who has a building named after him like our most recent building and library a few days ago.

It is a very difficult assignment, especially when you are a long time friend, and I suppose it is hardly necessary for me to mention to this distinguished group that Judge Murrah was really a "workaholic", if I can say it right, but anyway, he worked so hard that we never had much fun, but what I want to talk about today is some of the fun that we did have, because I don't think this needs to be too serious.

As a matter of fact, he was such a friendly and courageous man. He had courage because he asked me to speak to the Tenth Circuit two times, and to the American Bar two times, and that took a great deal of courage because in the first place, I am certainly not a lawyer; in the second place, I am not a speaker. So he had the courage to do both of those things, and he did that because he was just such a warm human being, and if I were to write a book about him, I think it would be entitled, "Judges Are People."

I think that's one of the best ways to describe

Judge Murrah, because he was a very friendly man with quite widespread interests. As a matter of fact, his interests were in
his family, his church, his job, in education and civic and
cultural activities.

And so I want to talk about those a little bit today,

but also a few incidents about his life that I happened to participate in to some extent.

Perhaps my first contact with Judge Murrah was when he was with Judge Bohanon. Do you want to hold up your hand, Judge Bohanon? With Judge Bohanon over at the Seminole oil field where they, I think, slept in their office. My contact with Judge Murrah was, we had a team of mules pulling some transformers through the center of town, and they fell down, and both of them drowned.

So the IRS, as is their custom, they didn't believe it, and so we had to get Judge Murrah to make an affidavit about the dead mules.

That was my first contact with him, but I think it is rather interesting to realize that he went from that muddy city of Seminole where mules could drown in the middle of town, to the Dolley Madison House in Washington, D. C. Of course he had a few intermediate stops, but the important thing is to think that anybody could keep their perspective so well to go from a city like Seminole was in those days -- I could tell a lot more about it but I'd better not do that -- but anyway, he made that change and kept his balance, and I think it is wonderful to think about that; and sometime thereafter, of course, he moved to Oklahoma City, and since his wife and my wife were sorority sisters, we became lifetime friends.

I will give one example of that friendship, which is

pretty important, at least to me. He and I were playing golf and there was a very strong wind behind us. I hit a high approach from pretty far back. I didn't think I hit the ball that far but I did with the help of the wind, and there was a lawyer just getting his ball, although he was known in these parts and even with ambulances, and so the ball hit this lawyer right in the back of the head just as it came down.

I was worried, so I handed my club to Judge Murrah and I said, "Go up there and tell him you hit that shot."

So he went up and he said, "Lawyer, I want to apologize."

And the lawyer said, "I'm the one that should apologize. Your ball would have gone in the hole if my head hadn't been in the way."

So you can see that that was a true friend, but he did suggest to me thereafter that I ought to get some liability insurance if I was going to keep on hitting like that.

But I should say something about him, too, that in religion Judge Murrah helped to build the Crown Heights Methodist Church. I think that he and in those days Judge Bohanon had a joint bank account wherein nobody knew who was helping build the church, but anyway, they built a church; and in young people's work he did so many things. He was a leader in the Last Frontier Council of the Boy Scouts. Beyond that, he encouraged any young man to become successful lawyers, like the Professor over here

8 9

who is going to speak later. In civic work he did many things that I think are worth mentioning. He headed the United Fund, and after that year that he had it we reached the goal every year for a long time. We had never reached it. He gave it the proper start.

Furthermore, to help the Orchestra, the Symphony Orchestry, he was head of the Beaux Arts Ball. That's a real chore to march in wearing all that regalia, but he did it.

But he had some time for fun as well as other things. I might mention one thing about that.

We, with three other couples and the Murrahs, decided to learn how to do the rhumba, and so we engaged a teacher and the teacher had a wife, a very beautiful blonde one, and so they both came to teach us every time, and the wife would always dance with the worst dancer. That happened to be Judge Murrah. I tried to dance the worst I could but he beat me very time. All you had to do was just dance and say "One, two, one, two, three" and then do the rhumba. I don't know, but he got to dance with the teacher almost all the time.

In any event, though, having learned to dance, we decided we would go to the Mardi Gras at New Orleans. We knew we would never be dancers like Judge Chandler but we thought we'd do the best we could, so we went down to the Mardi Gras. As soon as we got there it was just ready to start and they were giving badges that said "Committee".

Of course we didn't know what we were supposed to do, so as soon as we got the badges we were just standing there and in came a very distinguished looking lady, and she said, "I am Lady Makin. Will you gentlemen please seat me?"

Well, we said, "Well, we don't know where you are supposed to sit."

And it turned out the whole thing was in her honor. She had come from England just to be there that night.

Finally we could see we were getting in trouble, so we said, "We are imposters and maybe you are, too." We shouldn't have said that, it turned out, because the next day we went to the review of the parade and there we were sitting by her again, but she had no sense of humor whatever.

The next thing that happened, in came the Governor of Louisiana and the Mayor of New Orleans. They were supposed to have looked after her in the first place. If they had been on time we wouldn't have had this embarrassment.

But anyway, I guess I had better return to more serious things. One other thing serious about it -- in a way it is serious -- he and I went quail hunting, that is, Judge Murrah and I went; so I went one way for awhile and he went the other. I fired quite a few shots and finally got me a quail, and when he came back I said, "How did you get along?"

He said, "Well, I got my limit."

I said, "You did? I only heard you fire one shot."

3

4

6

7 8

9

10 11

12

13

14 |

15

16

17

18

22

23

24

And he said, "That's my limit." He said, "I don't like to shoot those birds anyway."

That's just the kind of a person he was. back to more serious things for a moment, Judge Murrah really served with distinction on the Southern Methodist University Board of Directors as Trustee. He did a lot of good for them and of course he did a lot of good on Oklahoma University.

In the Law School they have a new building and he was instrumental in the development down at Norman; so he kept on doing all of these things despite the fact that he was so busy.

Finally, I had better say that he engaged in a very fine situation all over, wherever he went.

As I suggested in the first place, he was active in the American Bar over the years. I think he was one of the ones, with Judge Phillips, who encouraged the meeting of this group every year in those conferences where he asked me to speak twice. Of course that was one of his mistakes.

But finally, I think I ought to mention his family life. Despite being headquartered in Denver and Washington, he commuted back and forth, and he called up to see how his son Paul was be-21 having pretty often, often to see if he was working -- and so he was a real commuter and he did so many things that all of us in Oklahoma have appreciated.

I think as I close my remarks in this building I should 25 add that by every count he was a man for all seasons.

that's the best way I could describe him, and I think I shall long remember him as a real friend.

Thank you very much.

CHIEF JUDGE SETH: Thank you very much.

Professor Gibbens, would you step forward, please.

Professor Gibbens is a long time associate of Judge Murrah. We all know you from the academic world. We would be happy to hear from you.

PROFESSOR GIBBENS: Thank you, Judge Seth.

May it please the Court, and family and friends of Chief Judge Murrah:

In 1952 a tough-minded theoretrician, writing about one of the more technical areas of the law, stated: "The decision was explained in a compact, but complete and luminous, opinion by Judge Murrah, an opinion which well could serve as the text for a class in the technique of judicial composition."

These 1952 words were written by Maurice H. Merrill, who is now Research Professor Emeritus at the University of Oklahoma.

At the time of Judge Murrah's death, a letter to the editor appeared in one of the Oklahoma City newspapers, from a nationally eminent Justice on the Massachusetts State Supreme Court. It read as follows: "The death of Judge Alfred P. Murrah constitutes a loss not only to the State of Oklahoma and the Federal Judiciary, but also to the state Judicial systems to

which he contributed so much. As first and former President of the National Center for State Courts, I am in a unique position to testify to the assistance which he provided so willingly in the early days of the Center. Without his kindness and wise advice, the great work in which the Center is now engaged would not have proceeded as rapidly as it has. Oklahomans should know that state court judges, as well as federal judges throughout the United States, had the highest regard and warmest respect for him."

.5

In July of 1976, at the dedication of the new Law Center at the University of Oklahoma, then Retired Justice Tom C. Clark of the United States Supreme Court said these words:

"I noticed when I arrived here this afternoon that the Program of Dedication was in memory of Judge Alfred P. Murrah. It is certainly fitting that the new Law Center be dedicated to the memory of this stalwart Oklahoman. He was a member of the University's original Law Center Commission, and I remember him when he talked to me about it prior to the organization of the Commission. He kept me informed from time to time about the progress being made.

"As Governor Boren earlier stated, Al contributed immeasurably to the establishment of this Law Center, which I am
sure will develop into one of the great Law Centers of our country. Al Murrah is not here in place today, but as I walked
around the Law Center, I saw his works. His presence is not only

all around the place, but it is also in the hearts of all of the people who work or come there. We miss Al Murrah, not only at the Center -- not only in Washington -- but throughout this country of ours.

"However, his spirit shall always continue to live wherever good people gather together to improve the administration of justice, for he is the guiding light of that endeavor. He continues to be a great and faithful leader and so shall it always be."

These three quotations, I think, the areas in which the Judge was perhaps best known, as a professional, anyway, as a legal craftsman, as an exceptional law reformer, and as a promoter of excellence in legal education.

I'd like to say a few words about the legal education aspect of his work, because he did give much of his time and talent to many law schools over the nation, responding willingly to invitations to speak to law students and assist in a variety of educational programs.

His efforts are perhaps best known at Southern Methodist University, which Mr. Kennedy mentioned, also Oklahoma City University, their Law School as well as the University of Oklahoma where he graduated in 1928.

With these institutions he served in a variety of specific advisory and implementation capacities, endeavoring always to promote the growth of programs of the highest quality,

directed toward educating the lawyers and judges of the future.

At the entrance of our new Law Center building, there are two large bronze plaques. One of course lists the President and Officers of the University at the time that building was begun. On the other plaque is listed the members of the Law Center Commission, together with their chairman, Judge Murrah.

Now this was a body that was formed in 1969. The members included a number of people of national stature, including Erwin Griswold, then Solicitor General of the United States and for twenty-five years Dean of the Harvard Law School, and also included Dean Charles Galvin of the SMU Law School, and others nationally; and among Oklahoma people was David Boren, who was then State Representative from Seminole County, and of course is our present Governor.

In this Law Center Commission work, the Judge utilized his talents for effective promotion as well as his focus on excellence. In a letter in my files dated March 4, 1969 to his fellow members of this Commission, he stated this:

"Since our meeting last Monday I have been gravely concerned lest we fail to grasp the conceptual dimensions of the Law Center. As I indicated just as we were leaving, we seem to be more concerned about the preservation of the status quo than the establishment of a Law Center to serve the future needs of this state. The Regents and the Administration have said that our Law Center shall be great, and I am determined to take them

at their word. Our 'Whereases' are more negative than they are affirmative. Let's lift our eyes to the hills and meet the challenge."

The Commission responded to the Judge's urgings, and formulated concrete plans not just for the new Law Center building, which of course we have, but for an enlarged group of programs tailored to meet the future needs of the state, and of course the challenge of the Judge's words is still fresh on our minds.

As those of us who are gathered here today well know, these kinds of comments are just a sampling of the many efforts over the years to acknowledge the good works and the rich life of Judge Murrah.

Because of the very rich diversity of his activities —
because of the intensity of the efforts which he gave to each of
them, and because of the fast pace at which he lived, (one had to
stay, I think, in good physical condition just to keep up with
him walking from his car to the office) — he is well remembered
and well loved by a large number and a wide variety of people;
and I think really it's the people that perhaps, again as Mr.
Kennedy mentioned, that perhaps should be the focus here as well.

The Twentieth Century American system of justice was the focus of his life, and it may be that this system of justice is one of the true marvels of the history of mankind. It has shown itself to have the capacity to adapt itself to the various

crises of human affairs. It has shown itself to have a capacity to dispense justice to all sorts of conditions of people -- to a President who would perhaps put himself in some ways above the law -- to the poorest and meanest of those who live among us -- and to the largest and most powerful of our corporate business entities.

No one says that this system is perfect. Certainly Judge Murrah didn't say so. But his life was dedicated, I think, to the proposition that this system was very much worth working on to make it work better. Perhaps this is the true genius of this marvel of human history, this American system of justice, that so many strong and good people have devoted so much of their lives to its improvement. There is no doubt that it was improved by Judge Murrah.

But what is this American system of justice? It has, to be sure, many elements that might include laws, customs and procedures. To these institutions Judge Murrah gave so much of his life working on; but if these institutions are thoughtfully analyzed and reduced down to the bare bones, as Judge Murrah liked to talk about as he worked on his opinion, "To get it down to the bare bones" -- this immense and complex system is made up of nothing more than the people who work in it and make it work.

Chief Justice John Marshall said with characteristic perceptiveness in 1803, "The Government of the United States has been emphatically termed a government of laws, and not of men."

 One of our founding fathers, Ben Franklin, stated with equal perceptiveness at the time that he was urging the adoption of our present Constitution in 1787, "There is no form of government but what may be a blessing to the people if well administered, and I believe further that this is likely to be well administered for a course of years, and can only end in despotism, as other forms have done before it, when the people shall become so corrupted as to need despotic government, being incapable of any other."

Judge Murrah's life spanned the last one-third of our nation's first two hundred years, and the Constitution which Mr. Franklin urged on his colleagues is nearing its two-hundredth birthday. During all this "course of years", we can see that our government and especially our system of justice has been indeed well administered, but especially so, I think, in the time frame with which we are most familiar and in which the Judge so heavily invested himself, the last few years. And obviously, it is the people who do the administering. It is people who have worked at it, made it work, and most especially perhaps people such as Judge Murrah who worked at this task so intensively and effectively.

I think we all know as well that Judge Murrah's impact on the system is more than working on the laws and procedures and customs of the practice of law and the practice of courts.

Again, the Judge knew that the system at the present

 time and in the future is no more than the people who work on it and in it, and accordingly it is accurate to say that the Judge's living was focused really, it seems, not so much on the system of justice but on people, people within the system and people outside of the system.

I think really the Judge would be entirely uncomfortable at the suggestion that his professional efforts were devoted to something as impersonal as the system. He is well and lovingly remembered because truly his professional efforts and the whole of his living was directed to people -- to the individual people with whom he lived, and not an abstract system.

I would like to relate a little bit of a personal example of the Judge's relationship to people. This reflects his relationships to his law clerks, and of course that was initially where I got to know the Judge.

I think all of those who had the good fortune to serve as his law clerk look back on that experience as incredibly rich. As the Judge was sensitive to the needs of individual people, and he was indeed, I am quite sure that he adjusted his working habits and relationships to a certain extent to fit his clerk's individual needs.

But with a number of us -- some of us have talked about this quite a bit -- there were two standard operating procedures that the Judge used on his law clerks. One was that each clerk became, after a few weeks on the job, really a very few, fewer

than was really quite appropriate, each clerk became after a few weeks on the job, "The very best one I ever had."

And then the second working procedure was that each one of us felt at about the same time the spurs of an instigator of activity and a seeker of excellence. He was never quite satisfied with our performance and he was always pushing, prodding, spurring and challenging us to see if we couldn't learn, that we could be more productive than we already were or thought we were, that we could work harder. Most of us thought we had already learned to work pretty hard, and so his efforts were to encourage us to learn something about ourselves. I learned indeed how much we could do.

There was one special feature of the Judge's work with his law clerks and it involved another sharing activity. I am sure that many who have not experienced this feature would think it was an onerous task maybe.

One of the conditions of employment as his law clerk was to drive the Judge to and from work each morning and evening. As those of us who did it know well, it was not an onerous task at all, but one of the most enriching aspects of our association with the Judge.

It gave the Judge and his clerk, both of whom were particularly busy, short of time, a regular period nearly every day in which they could converse about those things which were nearest and dearest to them, whether it be the benefits of church

participation and Sunday School teaching, or the benefits of sex love and marriage, or beauties of people seen along the way to work, or the beauty of the sky itself which deserved to be noticed from time to time; things of this life to be shared and to be enjoyed among people who find themselves working together.

These trips to and from the office were indeed a very special time. I think they reflect the Judge's awareness of the need to utilize fully the limited time we are allocated in this life, and his awareness that it was not really the system with which he was engaged in his work, but it was people, and the law clerk of course was one of these people who had the good fortune to have this daily experience.

In closing, I would say, I think, the obvious thing.

Judge Murrah had a larger sense of life, I think, and a larger
capacity for life than most people. He loved the law. There is
no doubt about that. But he loved more the whole of living, and
he loved people; and law to him was merely a part of people, and
a part of living.

His contributions to those he worked with and those he lived with were extraordinarily many, extraordinarily varied and extraordinarily rich.

I think that those that had the pleasure of associating with him at one time or another during our lives feel the richness of it in particular.

Thank you.

CHIEF JUDGE SETH: Thank you, Professor Gibbens.

I will ask Judge Holloway to respond.

Judge Holloway.

Chief Judge for eleven years.

· 4

Ω

 \cap

JUDGE HOLLOWAY: Chief Judge Seth, Mrs. Murrah, and friends, the monumental contributions of Judge Murrah as a Judge, as a leader of Judges, and in judicial reform, have been eloquently recounted by Chief Justice Burger, by the late Mr. Justice Clark and countless others; but beyond these contributions, we of the Court of Appeals for the Tenth Circuit do also have our special debt of gratitude to acknowledge to Judge Murrah, our

Each of us, and the Judges of this Circuit who have served with Judge Murrah, in his remarkable judicial career of almost forty years, have felt a rare inspiration and personal challenge from Judge Murrah.

By the sheer force of his personality and his deep dedication, Judge Murrah has shaped the course of this Circuit and this Court, and has given us a momentum that still moves us.

Judge Murrah began his service on this Court in the early days of Judge Phillips, Judge Bratton, Judge Huxman, and his dear and close personal friend, Judge John C. Pickett.

Judge Pickett planned to be with us today but had to call and regret because of illness of his wife.

Those Judges I have mentioned, and all of us who have served with him, have special memories of Judge Murrah. Perhaps

our keenest memories are of his humor, his kindness, and his wise counsel, but despite the different perspectives we each have of him, our memory in common of Judge Murrah is, I think, of his boundless energy and dedication to the judiciary.

The Chief was always encouraging us to do our best, to rededicate ourselves to the increasing tasks ahead, to deal with the mounting case load with innovation, and still to keep the quality of justice up to the standard worthy of the rich traditions of this Court.

This is our heritage from Judge Murrah, and it is an imperishable page in the history of this Court and all the courts of this land.

CHIEF JUDGE SETH: Thank you.

I think all of us who had the very good fortune to serve with Judge Murrah will always remember with great pleasure this dynamic, sensitive, compassionate person. All of you who are here today, I am sure, who worked with or associated with him would each have your own memories of this unusual man.

It is easy to say that men have many talents, but there are exceedingly few who are of many talents and who also are able to direct these talents effectively for the good of so many people under such a variety of circumstances as Judge Murrah.

I think, also, Judge Murrah was especially blessed with the presence, encouragement, and the companionship and help from his dear wife and from his family. I think that had a very im-

portant part in his life and contributed greatly to his success in all of his endeavors. Is there anything further, Mr. Clerk? MR. HOECKER, Clerk: I believe there is nothing further today, your Honor. CHIEF JUDGE SETH: Court will be in recess subject to call. (The proceedings are adjourned.) CERTIFIED A TRUE TRANSCRIPT May 18, 1978